Manila as Sophie's World: Mapping Sites of Wonder in 19th c. Intramuros and Environs

Jovino G. Miroy[1]

jmiroy@ateneo.edu

Abstract

This paper draws a philosophical heritage map of Intramuros and environs. The map includes several religious sites in Intramuros and two monuments of heroes outside the walls. The paper explains the reason for drawing such a map by, firstly, discussing the theory of place-based learning. Secondly, it will discuss the philosophical walk as a dialogue with the environment (nature and the city). A philosophical heritage map is also understood not only as a tour of sites associated with philosophers and the history of ideas but a movement along sites of wonder, rumination, contemplation, and critical thinking. As such, walking as a philosophical practice means bringing philosophy back to the streets to understand the plight of the marginalized. Thirdly, it will give examples of the three kinds of philosophical walks. The study ends with a discussion of the implications of a philosophical heritage map of Manila.

Keywords: place-based learning, philosophical walk, heritage map

I. Introduction

A philosophical heritage map of Intramuros and nearby districts refers primarily to spaces associated with philosophers and the history of philosophy.[2] The map commences at the ruins of the Ateneo Municipal, a site which alludes to Athens, the city dedicated to Pallas Athena and where classical thinkers converged. The next site is the San Agustin Church and Museum. The map proceeds to the old and current sites of the University of Santo Tomas. As spaces related to Spanish Scholasticism, however, the sites of the oldest university in Asia were historically locations of metaphysical and ethical discourses on the nature of human beings and relationship with God. The philosophical heritage map is not confined to spaces established by colonial and religious institutions. It includes the Rizal Monuments at Luneta and Fort Santiago, as well as the Mabini Shrine in Sta. Mesa. In these locations, the idea of philosophy is social and modern, becoming basis for what is now known as Filipino philosophy.[3]

The paper explains the rationale behind the proposal to draw a philosophical heritage map of Manila. First, it will discuss the idea of place-based learning; then, it will discuss "philosophical walks." Finally, it will describe existing philosophical tours and walks in the world as paradigms of philosophical heritage map for Manila.

II. Place based education and learning

Our proposed mapping of the philosophical heritage of Manila arises from the desire for a more effective pedagogy in teaching philosophy. The most difficult part in teaching philosophy is to make students experience abstract and high-flown ideas. Philosophical texts, especially primary texts, can be alienating, since they are many times removed from Filipino students' daily experience. For students to figure out what is going on in

[1] Jovino de Guzman Miroy is a faculty member of the Philosophy Department of the Ateneo de Manila University. He obtained his doctorate from the Katholieke Universiteit te Leuven (Belgium) and authored *Tracing Nicholas of Cusa's Early Development: The Relationship between De concordantia catholica and De docta ignorantia* (*Philosophes Medievaux*, 2009). Aside from publishing in Philosophy, he has articles on the intersection between Philosophy and the history of art and architecture in the Philippines. He is currently a contributing writer for Manila Times (Build and Design Section). He has a practice in cultural and public diplomacy. In 2020, he wrote a play entitled *Marcelo: Pasyong Dapat Ipag-alab ng Puso* under the auspices of UP OICA.

[2] For the foundations of the building of Intramuros in Greco-Roman philosophy, cf. Agencia Estatal Boletín Oficial del Estado (1998).

[3] The same can be said of writers of the *awit* and *corrido*, like Francisco Baltazar and Huseng Batute. cf. J. G. Miroy (2021).

the *Apologia of Socrates*, for example, they need to imagine where the trial of Socrates actually took place or how Athens and Delphi looked like or what an *agora* was. For this reason, either teachers make students read texts which are closer to their experience or adopt a pedagogy that allows them to enter into the world of classical and primary texts—a veritable Sophie's world of wonder.

One such pedagogy is called place-based education or learning. "Place-based education might be characterized as the pedagogy of community, the reintegration of the individual into her home ground and the restoration of the essential links between a person and her place" (Stickney, 2020, p. 1076; cf. Sobel, 2004). Students find philosophy classes daunting because more often than not they have to read texts (primary texts of classical and canonical authors) right from the start of the term. Place-based learning, on the other hand, does not privilege the text. Instead, it privileges the community and puts the individual learner within the context of his or her own local community—the home ground—in order to restore the inseparable link between person and place. Obviously, learning is not reduced to what happens in the classroom, or more accurately put, the classroom includes places of the community. This kind of learning is often employed in classes on the environment.

Place-based learning is an idea as old as philosophy itself:

> The outdoor classroom is an honorable tradition, going back to Aristotle's Lyceum, a courtyard that has the word 'wolf' (Greek, lykos) in its name. The Stoics of course met under porches (stoa), and Heraclitus received students beside an outdoor hearth, 'where too the gods dwell'. (Stickney, 2020, p. 1071; cf. Heidegger, 1977)

Furthermore, the Buddha received enlightenment by sitting under a banyan tree and Jesus of Nazareth taught in the mountains and boats on the lake of Galilee.

Place-based learning is experiential learning that transpires within time and space. Even more importantly, this is learning which allows the individual to find his or her own connection with the community. The idea of place as a locus of learning is to bring the person out of their own skin and into the arena of the community. Most pedagogies exploit the industrial model of education, which puts greater emphasis on individual effort, and thus diminishes the place of the community. Learning has always been understood as the effort expended by the individual and happened either in school or in the home, while places like clubs and sports courts are for extracurricular activities. The result is that the community becomes a less vital source of learning. In the digital age, the internet has made students uncomfortable in concrete and actual places. This also meant greater cocooning and non-engagement with the community.

Place-based education (PBE), on the other hand, "immerses students in local heritage, cultures, landscapes, opportunities, and experiences, using these as a foundation for the study of language arts, mathematics, social studies, science, and other subjects across the curriculum" (Vander Ark, et al., 2020, p. 2; cf. Falk, 2012). Connecting students with local heritage, place- based learning is also about natural landscapes and outdoor experiences rooted in time and space as foundation for the formal learning (reading texts, assessments, classroom work). Significantly, Jose Rizal while in exile in Dapitan, built a school which made full use of the space. It did not only make use of the garden to instill agricultural skills but also made full of the nearby forest for character formation and the beach for physical education. [4] Schools today, however, usually consider greenery either as decoration or security features.

This way, education happens anytime and anywhere, that is, it does not happen exclusively in designated hours and places. It also leverages the power of place to personalize learning. The power of place increases students' engagement and community involvement. This means greater investment of the student with their own learning as well as their commitment with the community. Learning is the capacity of the learner to change one's relationship with the environment; this is impossible if a direct link with the environment has not been forged.

Furthermore, place-based learning means "connecting projects to community, delving into authentic problems, and encouraging public products develop an ethic of contribution" (Vander Ark, et al., 2020, p. 2). This engagement with the community means coming into face-to-face contact with authentic problems and thus eliciting real contribution from students. "Solutions to many of our ecological problems lie in an approach that celebrates, empowers, and nurtures the cultural, artistic, historical, and spiritual resources of each local community and region" (Vander Ark, et al., 2020, p. 2). In this philosophy of education, culture and heritage become a source of solutions to ecological problems. There is no dichotomy between the scientific approach to solving problems and the creative and artistic and historical approaches. The philosophical map seeks to encounter social problems (urban, environmental, and social issues), as well as empower students to offer solutions for them.

On the one hand, education has become disconnected from community, and thus, it does not really emphasize agency, that is, the capacity of students to help themselves support the community.

> Agency is the capacity and propensity to take purposeful initiative. It is the opposite of helplessness. Young people with high levels of agency do not respond passively to their circumstances; they tend to seek meaning and act with purpose to achieve the conditions they desire in their own and others' lives. It is developed through activities that are meaningful and relevant to learners, driven by their interests, and often self-initiated with appropriate guidance from teachers. To put it simply, student agency gives

[4] cf. Villaroman (2018), pp. 109-129.

> students voice and, often, choice in how they learn. (Vander Ark, et al., 2020, p. 5)

Students feel less agentic when they have a sense of being confined, both literally and metaphorically. Education must not result in feelings of being overwhelmed by personal and social problems. Classes today often result in analysis paralysis of oneself and the world, forcing students to become overly conscious of academic matters. They, thus, do not look for authentic purpose or dream beyond being gainfully employed. Authentic student-centered learning must lead to agency, that is, young people finding the power to respond to the world's problems. Effective philosophical education generates agency. At the same time, people erroneously think that agency is about having ambitious goals, which is ultimately a product of an individualized learning context.[5]

On the other hand, what is philosophical learning? What do we teach when we teach philosophy; when do students learn philosophy? As we said, the first thing philosophy classes do is to make students read philosophical texts. This is odd because philosophy is less about knowing abstract ideas and more about reflecting on one's experience and being able to articulate one's questions and to answer those questions oneself. Philosophy is not simply repeating what Plato said. A student has learned philosophy when he or she is able to undergo the process of inquiry. Thus, there are two important outcomes of philosophy: inquiry and agency. For this reason, a place-based learning might be helpful, for it allows the student to come out of their head. Through this process, students begin to understand agency and inquiry through the power of place.

The philosophical map can make us ask fundamental questions about education. How does where we learn affect what we learn—and if and when we learn? In the Romantic period, pedagogues suggested that schools be built deep in the forest. Eventually, they rightly asked the question of greater place for play in the way schools are set up. Now, we ask if urban schools be designed as parks or should they alternatively be built close to beaches instead.

Arguably, drawing a philosophical heritage map springs from Jean-Jacques Rousseau's idea of letting nature teach us: "the laconic educator does not describe things but lets the student make his *[sic]* own observations, building knowledge of geography and astronomy from experience instead of memorizing precepts" (Stickney, 2020, p. 1075; Rousseau, 1979). In letting nature teach, the teacher realizes that the student does not learn from him or her; but they learn by making their own observations of geography and astronomy; most of all, the nature as teacher education philosophy implies that learning is not about memorizing thesis statements. What is crucial in philosophical education involves doubt and the articulation of experience. Place-based learning also believes that placelessness might instill an identity in students that is suited for conformity and obeisance (Stickney, 2020, p. 1076; Relph, 1976; Seamon & Sowers, 2008).

Place-based learning inculcates an education that is indigenous, or one rooted in the land. For this reason, it is genealogical, for in returning to the land, place-based learning digs into the heart of students and their authentic self (Stickney, 2020, p. 1077). A quick introduction to place based learning would be the entries found on the website of the UNESCO World Heritage Sites, especially the ones in the Philippines. Aside from explaining how philosophy figures in declaring world heritage sites, they also deftly illuminate how Vigan and Iloilo are sources of indigenous philosophical knowledge. The sources on Philippine Baroque Churches discuss how local builders have re-interpreted the European ecclesiastical architecture so that the churches would fit our geographical and climate conditions. These heritage sites (e.g. Miag-ao and Paoay) teach the necessity of looking to our local environment as a takeoff point for cultural production, allowing students to connect their search for their authentic self to the built environment. The materials on historic town of Vigan, on the other hand, inform how community engagement is key to heritage preservation. Designed to encourage everyone to travel meaningfully, the carefully prepared webpages encourage students to ask questions of value as well as hermeneutical ones. In relation to Vigan, they can learn to read continuity and discontinuity between the colonial and local; while in relation to Iloilo, they can learn to read the relationship between history and nature. As students gain rudimentary knowledge about construing spaces and buildings, they imbibe concepts such as what has universal and public value and the crucial role culture plays in human flourishing.[6]

---

[5] Place based learning is consistent with John Dewey's philosophy of education: "We never educate directly, but indirectly by means of the environment. Whether we permit chance environments to do the work, or whether we design environments for the purpose makes a great difference. And any environment is a chance environment so far as its educative influence is concerned unless it has been deliberately regulated with reference to its educative effect" (Dewey, 1944, p. 19; Stickney, 2020, p. 1073). For Dewey, education is towards a new and better relationship with one's environment. Education transpires through the design of environments that will bring out a better relationship between people and the world.

[6] UNESCO World Heritage Centre, *"Historic City of Vigan (UNESCO Canopy),"* https://whc.unesco.org/en/canopy/vigan; UNESCO World Heritage Centre, *"The Criteria for Selection,"* https://whc.unesco.org/en/criteria/; UNESCO World Heritage Centre, *"Rice Terraces of the Philippine Cordilleras,"* World Heritage List no. 502, https://whc.unesco.org/en/list/502/. UNESCO World Heritage Centre, *"Baroque Churches of the Philippines,"* World Heritage List no. 677, https://whc.unesco.org/en/list/677/; UNESCO, *"Enhancing UNESCO-Designated Sites as Learning Landscapes,"* https://www.unesco.org/en/articles/enhancing-unesco-designated-sites-learning-landscapes; UNESCO, *"Learning Landscapes: Equipping Interpretive Agents in Kotor,"* https://www.unesco.org/en/articles/learning-landscapes-equipping-interpretive-agents-kotor; UNESCO National Commission of the Philippines, *"World Heritage Sites in the Philippines,"* https://www.unesco.gov.ph/world-heritage-site-philippines/; Interpret Europe, *"Learning Landscapes: Value-*

III. Philosophical Walk

The philosophical walk is not a gait associated with the philosopher, who ambles head bowed and arms locked at the back. Nor is it to absent-mindedly walk in the clouds, in the very way Aristophanes described Socrates in his parody of the philosopher. The person he describes is obviously deep in contemplation and is lost in his own thoughts. Such a picture negates what we have been saying that education hopes to bring students out of their own heads and skins and allows them to engage their environment.

In the first place, walking has always been associated with the philosophical act. One explanation of how Greek philosophy developed is that these emerged from accounts of virtual tours of places where heroic struggles of heroes like Hercules or athletes:

> These accounts were virtual tours of landmarks based on legends (Hercules' travails) and monumental graves of famous residents, feats of athletes and war heroes, wonders of nature or miracles and other story-worthy information you might hear in small towns and inner-city communities today. (Stickney, 2020, p. 1073)

Heritage walks arise from the same impulse to commemorate heroic and virtuous actions as well as places of hierophanies.

Walking, on the other hand, is an ancient practice mentioned by Plato. Aristotle taught while walking; while the Stoics are named precisely for the Stoa, the porches under which they thought. In Plato's *Phaedrus*, we read the first philosophical walk documented in Western Philosophy. "In this dialogue Socrates takes a walk with Phaedrus along the Ilissus river in search for the right spot to philosophize about love" (Harteloh, 2013, pp. 1297-1302). To understand this particular way of thinking, we can contrast it to the method described in the *Symposium*, where discourse occurred in the context of a drinking party. Walking's place in philosophy is also found amongst the moderns. Nietzsche used it to describe his struggle in life. Rousseau, on the other hand, looks to it as a way for self-discovery. Kant is famous for seeing it as a concretization of the imperative and discipline of thinking. Heidegger used it recourse to nature; and Gandhi viewed it as a way to experience the mystical. In more contemporary times, the Vietnamese Buddhist guru Thich Nhat Hanh devised what is known as "the walking meditation" (Hanh, 2024). I have often used it as a form of focused attention practice to clear my mind and work out how and what to teach (Munar, et al., 2021).

Perhaps it can be said that a philosophical walk is always done with others, even if one is a solitary traveler. Walking with others redefines the philosophical act. This way, the study of philosophy is not mainly reading texts, or a hermeneutical act. Rather, it is an immersion in time and space, and in landscapes. Roque Ferriols, SJ (1997b) drummed into his student's heads that philosophy is reflecting about one's experience. Ferriols himself often narrated his walks in New York City and Binondo, and how such walks informed his thinking. For this reason, the philosophical walk has been devised to recover this sense of philosophy as primarily not something we read but something we do.

The philosophical walk has several types. It may be a combination of a touristic sight-seeing and one designed for hardcore philosophical inquiry. One, the walk is a tour of places and sites associated with philosophers and the history of philosophy. For example, discovering spaces dedicated to great thinkers, like Erasmus in Rotterdam, or the monument of Albert the Great in Koln, or the tomb of Francisco Suarez in Lisbon.

More importantly, a philosophical walk would require visiting spaces of wonder, that is, of rumination, contemplation, and critical thinking. A place of rumination would require silence and is designed for mulling and deep thought. The M Museum in the university city of Leuven encourages visitors to think about big themes, like time. A Zen Garden, on the other hand, encourages contemplation.

A philosophical space would also purport milieus for critical thinking, or settings of inquiry. Perhaps this is a Parisian café, or a space where great contestations and debates have transpired, like in the Faneuil Hall in Boston or the ruins of the Berlin wall. Before the pandemic, my classes were tasked to perform a walking tour exercise. Students were to design a tour that would instigate thinking about sacred spaces (a worship hall) and public/civic spaces (a park), the relationship between existing structures (a sari-sari store) and the indigenous and ancestral spaces (house in Quiapo); colonial (heritage church) and democratic spaces (Senate House); between the ungoverned (a private garden) and the governed spaces (city hall); formal (school campus) and informal spaces (street basketball court).

The philosophical walk, additionally, is designed as a dialogue, with oneself, with others, and the environment.

> First of all, an inner dialogue of the participant with herself, second a dialogue among the participants (the others) and third a dialogue of participants with their surroundings (nature or city). The ground rules serve the purpose of structuring the different types of dialogue. (Harteloh, 2013, p. 1298)

Crucial to understanding the philosophical walk, therefore, is the meaning of dialogue, which can be an inner dialogue.

> While walking the participants keep silent, they are involved in an inner dialogue (contemplating the quote) and they process sense impressions from the surrounding environment. They are allowed to call

Based Interpretive Planning at UNESCO-Designated Sites (2024–2026)," https://interpret-europe.net/initiatives/learning-landscapes-value-based-interpretive-planning-at-unesco-designated-sites-2024-2026/.

> for a stop and speak in order to exchange thoughts with other participants. (Harteloh, 2013, p. 1298)

The idea of the walk is for one to use the quote to be able to interact with the environment. Philosophy serves as a prompt for greater awareness and consciousness of the power of place. In a philosophical walk conducted at Holargos Park in Athens, the walk became a non-literal recreation of the Socratic dialogue:

> Dialogue, questioning, conceptualization and finding the right spot for philosophizing are the hallmarks of such an exercise. On this occasion the walk was done at the foot of the hills where the ancient (now dry) sources of the Illisus are located, the river along which Socrates and Phaedrus once took a philosophical walk which made the walk very special. (Harteloh, 2013, p. 1299)

What is more, the philosophical walk is one designed to generate new pathways in the city. This one is based on the idea of philosophy as going back to the streets or the everyday. As such, it is philosophy designed to walk in the shoes of the oppressed and the marginalized. "Moreover, a focus on the streets of Scranton and its neighborhoods brings philosophy down from its perch above and reconnects philosophy to the plight of those who are most oppressed" (Meagher, 2007, p. 10; Engels 1971; De Certeau, 1984). This means, a philosophical walk is not necessarily associated with spaces of great thinkers—any street or city may be a setting for a philosophical walk. In this type of walk, the idea is to bring philosophy back to the streets, in the same way that Socrates philosophized in the streets of Athens: "De Certeau's solution is to return to the streets, to narrate everyday life and so, to reveal the interdependence of our theories and our practices" (Meagher, 2007, p. 15). De Certeau calls it philosophy of the everyday life, which he did to explain how theories and practices depend on each other. Philosophy is no longer the yearning for leisure or the wish to separate from everyday life, or what is known as the workaday life. A philosophical space is not to be perched on a *mirador*, or lookout, from which one might survey all that is going on through a panoptical *meta-vision*. As such, the philosopher does not walk, but stands as a universal mind, contemplating abstract ideas. Walking, on the other hand, is anti-panoptical vision for one only has a limited and contextualized view from the street. Thus, the philosopher is forced to move (that is, to doubt and question) and to always seek. It is the impulse of the pilgrim, but one who realizes that the journey is the destination. This also means that the point of the philosophical walk is to discover alternative routes in navigating the city. A person who walks and wanders is always getting lost, as it were. This way, however, the philosopher does not ride, but staggers with others who cannot afford to buy private transportation. He or she literally walks in the shoes of the oppressed and the tired masses.

This is called "situated marginality:" "Philosophical streetwalkers,…, walk in the shoes of the oppressed and develop their critical, normative perspective from that position of situated marginality" (Meagher, 2007, p. 16). This is the position of the tourist inasmuch as the tourist is as vulnerable as the worker. They are exposed to being lost and the wiles of the Gypsies. Wanderers are totally dependent on the kindness of strangers who hopefully give them right directions. The tourist, like the laborer, is also always open to suspicion: will they abuse their welcome, will they be able to support themselves, will they clean up after themselves? The philosophical walk brings thinking back to the streets, to the jeepney ride, to the bicycle ride. There is a legend that Fr. Ferriols would hang on the *estribo* of a jeepney on the way to Katipunan. Reading his works written in the vernacular, one senses the din and brume of the city. Ferriols' (1992, 1997a) thought is consistent with the idea of place-based learning which allows students to engage in their own learning and their own community, confronting authentic problems, and being empowered to offer concrete solutions.

IV. Types of Philosophical Walks

Let us give examples of the three kinds of philosophical walks to provide evidence that a city can be experienced philosophically, and that both tourist companies and ordinary travelers have wished to visit sites associated with the history of philosophy. This proves that such a desire is not as esoteric as one might think. The first one talks about touristic walks found in websites and travel guides. The second part talks about the philosophical walks designed by two philosophy teachers, one performed at Nanjing University and another at Scranton Pennsylvania. These examples can also provide as models for a possible mapping of the philosophical heritage of Manila.

A. Touristic Philosophical Walks: Athens and Qufu

Our first example of a philosophical walk designed for tourists is entitled "Philosophy Attractions of Athens: Where to Go If You're Interested in Ancient Wisdom," written by Robertson (2022). In the sites, he included Plato's Academy Park, called *Akadimia Platonos*, about 20-minute walk from the Acropolis, where one can see a statue of Plato and tinker with a digital museum introducing Platonism. The second site is the Lyceum of Aristotle, located at Kolonaki, one of the most affluent suburbs of Athens. The third site is the Acropolis, the temple of Athena Parthenos from which one can see the Agora where Socrates taught. It is considered that it is also here that he was tried and imprisoned. Here one is very near the Museum of the Ancient Agora. This site is also associated with the Stoics, for at the edge of the Agora is the *Stoa Poikile* (Painted Porch). One may also go to the Temple of Apollo at Delphi where the Oracle declared that Socrates was the wisest of all Athenians.

Another example, is entitled "Confucius temple day tour in Qufu, start from Qufu bullet train station or city" (TripAdvisor, n.d.). The blurb reads like an advertisement to a theatrical show:

> Confucius is great sage of China. Today, you'll have in depth exploration of Confucianism in the hometown of Confucius. The highlight is to visit "San Kong", the name given collectively to the three main sites of Confucius: the Confucian Temple, The Confucian Mansion and the Confucian Cemetery. You will get a full understanding about the life of Confucius, as well as the Confucian culture. Confucius' thoughts influence us a lot, today why students should respect teachers, children respect parents, wife respect husband, Minister respect Emperor, etc. are all from Confucius mind, today. (TripAdvisor, n.d.)

B. Philosophical Walk as Dialogue

But our study would like to present the idea that the philosophical walk is not necessarily a sight-seeing exploration of places associated with great thinkers. The first is a philosophical walk performed in Nanjing University. "In 2013, I conducted a philosophical walk at the campus of Nanjing University as a demonstration of a philosophical exercise in Socratic style" (Harteloh, 2021, p. 10). Here the participant is expected to contribute to the design of the walk by choosing a spot for conceptualization. The aim is to deepen interpretations of quotations by associating it with a space. The interpretation is not aiming for correctness, necessarily. The tour transpired in residences for students, thus the students chose according to their personal experiences.

> After 10 minutes a participant stopped in front of a building that appeared to be a swimming pool. This is the place she connected with the saying of Heraclitus ("One cannot step twice into the same river"). Every time she came there for a swim, there was change. The water changed and she was changed. She could not step into the same pool twice. A participant stopped after 15 minutes of walking at the border of the pavement and the park (see Figure 2). The place resembles (a man-made and organized) communication between two kinds of substances: concrete (man-made) and grass (nature). The place resembles the content of the quotation ("It takes a wise man to learn from his mistakes, but an even wiser man to learn from others"). By communication containing oppositions or borderline experiences, we can identify mistakes and learn from them. (Harteloh, 2021, p. 11)

The author declares that the exercise normally produces a multiplicity of interpretations in terms of spots for conceptualization. A different space can refer to the same quotations, thus yielding a diversity of interpretation and readings. The interpretation can be Aristotelian: "The concept suits experience and the world. Other participants contemplate the sensations during the walk (quotation included) and they choose a spot related to the quotation by a concept" (Harteloh, 2021, p. 14). Other interpretations, however, were more Platonistic: "The world forms itself along the concepts. In this way, the walk shows different ways of conceptualization. We can compare them and relate them to the person conceptualizing. It enables the person to reflect on himself" (Harteloh, 2021, p. 14). Thus, the level of depth of interpretation varies according to the participants' knowledge of philosophy. Needless to say, a person with minimal or no knowledge of philosophy can still interpret the text and associate it with a space. What is crucial in this philosophical walk is the dialogue between the quotation, the environment in which the walk takes place, and the interpretation of participants which they do by referring to their personal experiences. The experience can be very poignant as their interpretations reveal their personalities and past, making the exercise a bonding experience for the group.

C. Philosophy as Back to the Streets

The next walk we will describe transpired in Scranton, Pennsylvania.

> So I hit the streets of Scranton and begin my philosophical walking tour of Scranton's hill neighborhood with a copy of Friedrich Engels' The Condition of the Working Class in England in 1844. And I tell this story with both de Certeau's idea of storytelling in mind as well as his concept of pedestrian speech acts. (Meagher, 2007, p. 16)

The use of Engels and de Certeau allowed the designer of the walk to read the upper and lower hill sections in terms of their visible differences in terms of how their geographic locations relate to their class; or put more accurately, how their class is literally located by their geography. This reminds us of a problem in South Korea where people who live in lower levels have less sunlight than those who live in higher levels, as depicted by the film, *Parasite* (2019).

The author continues to narrate:

> My students tend to read the neighborhood as de Certeau does, that is, they view everyday life from their perspectives as highly mobile pedestrians who are not only blind to the totalizing views of the city but also blind to their privilege. (Meagher, 2007, p. 17)

This means the students were able to read the space of their everyday life from the perspective of their own privilege as well as the standpoint of those who do not have the same advantage. Apathy is nothing more than being blind to one's own privilege, which can be healed by this kind of philosophical walk.

> On one walk with my students, we saw a group of men gathered on the porch of a lower hill home, drinking what looked like beer in the late morning. 'Look at that!' one of my students exclaimed to me, 'That's the problem—they don't work!' Others nodded in agreement. But I led my students down other paths. 'How do you know "they" do not work? Who are "they"? What other possible explanations might there be?' I asked. One student then suggested, 'maybe they work nightshift, so morning is really like night to them'. There are multiple readings of that

> street scene. Armed with Engels, they began to examine beneath appearances. (Meagher, 2007, p. 17)

The dialogue that transpires within the tour group is framed by Engels' thought as the Guide asks: "What other possible explanations might there be?" The walk allows them to analyze the situation more incisively as they begin to become conscious of their own initial reactions to everyday situations. One can imagine the same encounter in a walk in Intramuros and its environs where numerous informal settlers and homeless people congregate.

V. Philosophical Walk of Intramuros and Environs

We have seen a philosophical walk designed for tourists which is a journey of sites and museums associated with philosophers and the history of philosophy. These walks may include spaces for discourse and debate about ostensively philosophical matters, like what one will find in London ("London Philosophy Walks," n.d.) and New York (Cleary, 2015).[7] The second is designed by participants themselves as their response to quotations from philosophers. These quotations become sources of how sites can be interpreted philosophically. The walk is the whole experience of going around a perimeter understood philosophically through conceptions. Here a philosophical walk is framed by the idea of dialogue with the self, their companions, and the surroundings. The third type of a walk derives from philosophy in the streets informed by the thought of Engels and de Certeau. From these examples, we can design our own map of philosophical heritage of Intramuros and its Environs.

The proposed walk is primarily a regular tour of spaces associated with philosophers and the history of philosophy. It starts with the ruins of the Ateneo Municipal (Ateneo de Manila University, n.d.; Etimologías de Chile, n.d.). The site, which is basically barren and empty today, could be developed to remind us of how an Ateneo (called "Athenaeum" in other contexts) is a miniature Athens, that is, a locus of philosophical learning and discourse. Aside from being spaces for study and research, these are spaces of vibrant discourse, innovation, and reform. The Ateneo Campuses at Loyola Heights, Padre Faura (now a mall), Makati CBD, and Rockwell can also be understood in the same way. The adherence to Greek philosophy continues until today with the construction of the arts and innovation complex called *Arete*, Greek for excellence and virtue.

The following site is the San Agustin Church and Museum. This location might be reminiscent of a similar tour of the city of Rome as a guide to the good life (Samuelson, 2023). In the museum, one finds a series of gargantuan paintings depicting the life and conversion of the Bishop of Hippo. Visitors may understand philosophy as self-knowledge and pilgrimage towards the truth. The museum is also curated to introduce the Augustinian way of life of love and community. The potential of this space to communicate philosophy is enormous considering the influence of Augustinianism not only in the history of ideas but in contemporary thinking as well.

The third place is the old and present-day University of Santo Tomas, specifically the Arch of the Centuries which has a statue on top of the author of the *Summa Theologiae*. If the San Agustin monastery complex would instigate contemplation on order of love (*ordo amoris*), UST would instigate contemplation of the order of being (*ordo entis*). As such, these sites would refer to the relationship between metaphysics and social ethics, discourses on the nature of being human, the rights of natives, and work of justice and salvation, which became the focus of reflection of philosophers of this time.[8] Intramuros also nurtured prominent figures of the Filipinization movement, namely, Pedro Pelaez and Jose Burgos, who arguably antedated Rizal and Marcelo del Pilar and can be considered as early Filipino Philosophers. At the same time, the space will make students inquire into the place of art, architecture, and science in building an authentic Christian culture.

The map, however, does not end here. It proceeds towards the Rizal Monument and the Mabini Shrine at the Polytechnic University of the Philippines campus. Here the idea of philosophy goes beyond the classical and scholastic. While Rizal and Mabini themselves were educated in the Salamantine Scholastic tradition, they were able to form the proto-indigenous thinking that produced Filipino identity and culture. We can begin to contemplate our heroes' monuments not only in terms of their martyrdom but also in terms of the audacity and power of their thought. When in high school I passed by Nagtahan Bridge where one could glance Mabini's house by the banks of the Pasig, I got a sense of the communion with nature necessary to build a democratic philosophy as mentioned by Rousseau (1979). May this sense be recaptured in the present site of the shrine. Inquiry at these sites may point us to the intersection of philosophy and literature and make us delve into practical philosophy, that is, political and legal philosophy.

The proposed map of the philosophical cultural heritage of Intramuros and nearby districts may also incorporate elements of the two other types of philosophical walk as the walk may be done with quotations from Augustine of Hippo or Apolinario Mabini. The map could simply be a frame for an encounter with the local communities in these areas of the city. Be that as it may, the philosophical walk we are describing is not prototypical and is not designed to instill national pride (which is a noble aim in itself). Our map merely serves as an example to encourage others to re-imagine their city from the purview of philosophy and to draw their own philosophical heritage map. For example, Tagaytay City may have its own philosophical heritage map based on the idea of cultivating one's own garden as propounded

[7] See also Go Scotland Tours (n.d.), "Philosopher's Path" (n.d.), and "Philosopher's Way, San Francisco" (2024).

[8] cf. Schumacher (1999), pp. 1-42.

by Voltaire (2021). A philosophical map of Makati or San Juan City in Metro Manila might refer to modernistic and contemporary social philosophy in order to improve engagement with its constituents. Furthermore, a philosophical map which aims to grapple with the community does not have to be a tour of places associated with the history of philosophy. It is, simply put, to experience the city with the eyes of wonder, that is, contemplation and critical thinking, in order to respond to the community's needs with love and care.

VI. Implications of a Philosophical Heritage Map

Let us end our study with further questions that might arise from our proposed project to draw the philosophical heritage map of Intramuros and surrounding areas. First, for the medievalists the philosophical foundations of the city of Manila are quite obvious. The religious orders naturally constructed churches to give honor to their founders, like St. Augustine, St. Dominic, St. Francis, and St. Ignatius. As these spaces were places of formation of priests, they were naturally spaces for the study of philosophy and theology. It behooves us to ask to what extent was Intramuros constructed on philosophico-theological foundations. There are studies on the connection between the colonial project and the Spanish Scholasticism that developed at the University of Salamanca.[9] What are the implications if we returned to the association to the School of Salamanca in our understanding of Intramuros?

Secondly, our proposed philosophical heritage map ineluctably raises questions about indigenous or pre-colonial philosophical spaces, even in Intramuros and Manila. We welcome such a question, or objection, for then, we would be forced to ask what indigenous philosophy would be. We have referred to Rizal and Mabini as proto-indigenous thinkers. Aside from our pre-historic literature and art, many scholars of food studies have also examined our cuisine as sources of indigenous Filipino thinking. If we look to non-traditional text for sources of pre-colonial thinking, then, our understanding of a philosophical space would also change. The kitchens in Intramuros would certainly be part of the map.[10]

It behooves us to ask what other spaces should be included aside from convents and monuments? As we have said, if a philosophical space is understood as spaces of wonder, rumination, dialogue, and inquiry, then, what other spaces in Intramuros and Manila should qualify as a philosophical space? Shouldn't pre-Spanish settlements in Tondo and Binondo (not to mention Sta. Mesa and San Juan) be included as well? Moreover, a site well-suited for reflecting on death is Fort Santiago itself, where numerous natives were tortured and executed. The act of drawing the map itself is instructive in making us ask questions about the act of philosophizing as Filipinos.

Are Filipino thinkers tourists or travelers on the way to Enlightenment? The tourist is somebody promenading mainly for entertainment and distraction, while the traveler intends to grow and be enriched by perambulation through various sites. The logical consequence of such investigation would be to ask what is a space for public philosophy, as opposed to thinking in the comfort of one's study? The touristic map of philosophical Athens as well as the tour of Qufu might give us clues. Greece has always been considered the birth of democracy, and a tour of Athens may also be occasions to think about questions of democracy today. Qufu, the famously restored birthplace of Confucianism, might make us ask about the place of Chinese philosophy in their social philosophy. If philosophy included political philosophy, then, the philosophical heritage map of Manila would change. Be that as it may, the question of how we draw the map of Manila based on its intellectual heritage would certainly yield a rich harvest.

The idea of a philosophical walk provides a renewed understanding of Intramuros as a colonial heritage locale and Manila as a city. Drawing philosophical heritage map/s causes us to ask what and how we learn philosophy. Is philosophy primarily understood through reading of primary texts of the canonical authors? Philosophy indeed can be learned from a place-based curriculum as well. This is what the proposed map of the philosophical heritage of Intramuros and its environs strives to do. Perhaps we can introduce our students to philosophical learning using the power of place; this way, like Socrates, we can present philosophy as thinking in the streets. To be clear, it is not being proposed that students refrain from reading canonical and primary texts; but that the hermeneutical training be imbued with the power of place and community, in order for the study of philosophical inquiry to become agentic and responsive. This method encourages them to think (and act) about, with, and for the community. A philosophical map is a counter-map insofar as it provides agency and solidarity with the community of unmapped spaces.[11] Our philosophical walk of Manila might even be

[9] The philosophical heritage map we are drawing is related to the idea of a map of flows of communication in the colonial period: "It may even be possible to map flows of communications, the nodes in the web, some bigger, some smaller…Perhaps we would also find on it something like a "colonial scholasticism" as a clearly distinguishable epistemic community. On this map, Salamanca, Mexico, and Manila might suddenly lie very close together, closer than Madrid and Milan, for example" (Duve, 2021, p. 32; Cf. Hernandez, 1996).

[10] Cf. this lecture on the "kitchen of New Spain" at the LACMA (Los Angeles County Museum of Art, 2022). The description of the video reads: "Presented in conjunction with the exhibition, Archive of the World: Art and Imagination in Spanish America, 1500-1800, Cooking with LACMA: Kitchen of New Spain is a recorded Zoom talk that features Maite Gomez-Rejón, founder of ArtBites. In this video, Maite leads us through a manchamanteles recipe, connecting it to the Spanish American artwork and the life of 17th century intellectual woman Sor Juana Inés de la Cruz."

[11] For a discussion on the counter-map, cf. Bellone, et al. (2020), p. 18.

peppered with curated quotations from the classical authors, from Saint Augustine, St. Thomas, Rizal, or Mabini. Quotations from local contemporary thought may also be used. The point of drawing the philosophical heritage map of Manila is to carve untrodden alleys and byways in the city. As such, the study of philosophy does not reinforce cocooning but rather lures us out of our privileged comfort zones.

References

Ateneo de Manila University. (n.d.). *The Ateneo name and university seal*. https://www.ateneo.edu/about/ateneo-name-seal

Bellone, T., Engel-Di Mauro, S., Fiermonte, F., Armano, E., & Quiquivix, L. (2020). Mapping as tacit representations of the colonial gaze. In D. Specht (Ed.), *Mapping crisis: Participation, datafication and humanitarianism in the age of digital mapping* (pp. 17–37). University of London Press.

Bong, J. H. (Director). (2019). *Parasite* [Film]. Barunson E&A.

Centro de Estudios Políticos y Constitucionales & Agencia Estatal Boletín Oficial del Estado. (1998). *Recopilación de las leyes de los reynos de las Indias*. https://www.boe.es/biblioteca_juridica/publicacion.php?id=PUB-LH-1998-62

Cleary, S. C. (2015, November 23). *Where to philosophize in New York City*. HuffPost. https://www.huffpost.com/entry/where-to-learn-about-phil_b_8586898

de Certeau, M. (1984). *The practice of everyday life* (S. Rendall, Trans.). University of California Press. (Original work published 1980)

Dewey, J. (1944). *Democracy and education*. The Free Press.

Duve, T. (2021). The School of Salamanca: A case of global knowledge production. In T. Duve, J. L. Egio, & C. Birr (Eds.), *The School of Salamanca: A case of global knowledge production* (Vol. 2, pp. 1–42). Brill.

Engels, F. (1971). *The condition of the working class in England* (W. O. Henderson & W. H. Chaloner, Trans. & Eds.; 2nd ed.). Basil Blackwell. (Original work published 1845)

Etimologías de Chile. (n.d.). Ateneo. In *Diccionario etimológico castellano en línea*. Retrieved April 6, 2026, from https://etimologias.dechile.net/?ateneo

Falk, J. H. (2012). Travel and learning: A neglected tourism research area. *Annals of Tourism Research*, *39*(2), 908–927. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.annals.2011.11.016

Ferriols, R. J. (1992). *Mga sinaunang Griyego*. Office of Research and Publications, Ateneo de Manila University.

Ferriols, R. J. (1997a). A memoir of six years. In N. S. Que & A. M. G. Rodriguez (Eds.), *Pagdiriwang sa meron: A festival of thought celebrating Roque J. Ferriols, S.J.* (pp. 215–222). Office of Research and Publications, Ateneo de Manila University.

Ferriols, R. J. (1997b). Theological aspects of cultural adaptation. In N. S. Que & A. M. G. Rodriguez (Eds.), *Pagdiriwang sa meron: A festival of thought celebrating Roque J. Ferriols, S.J.* (pp. 223–237). Office of Research and Publications, Ateneo de Manila University.

Go Scotland Tours. (n.d.). *Enlightenment Edinburgh walking tour*. https://www.goscotlandtours.com/walking-tours-edinburgh/enlightenment-tour.html

Hanh, N. T. (2024, June 17). *Thich Nhat Hanh's walking meditation*. Lion's Roar. https://www.lionsroar.com/how-to-meditate-thich-nhat-hanh-on-walking-meditation/

Harteloh, P. (2013). Philosophical walks. *Philosophical Practice: Journal of the APPA*, *8*(3), 1297–1302.

Harteloh, P. (2021). The nine steps of a philosophical walk. *Journal of Human Cognition*, *5*(2), 4–16. https://doi.org/10.47297/wspjhcWSP2515-469901.20210502

Heidegger, M. (1977). Letter on humanism. In D. Krell (Ed.), *Basic writings* (pp. 189–242). Harper & Row. (Original work published 1947)

Hernandez, V. (1996). The Spanish colonial library institutions. *Philippine Studies*, *44*(3), 321–348. [suspicious link removed]

Interpret Europe. (n.d.). *Learning landscapes: Value-based interpretive planning at UNESCO-designated sites (2024–2026)*. https://interpret-europe.net/initiatives/learning-landscapes-value-based-interpretive-planning-at-unesco-designated-sites-2024-2026/

London Philosophy Walks. (n.d.). *Meetup*. https://www.meetup.com/london-philosophy-walks/

Los Angeles County Museum of Art. (2022, December 13). *Cooking with LACMA: The kitchen of New Spain* [Video]. YouTube. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=uub5pTD6Pbs

Meagher, S. M. (2007). Philosophy in the streets: Walking the city with Engels and de Certeau. *City*, *11*(1), 7–20. https://doi.org/10.1080/13604810701200722

Miroy, J. G. (2021). Ang awit bilang remix: Katutubo, wika, at pilosopiya. *UNITAS*, *93*(2), 1–14. https://unitasust.net/wp-content/uploads/2020/11/UNITAS-93-2-Miroy-Awit-Katutubo.pdf

Munar, A. M., Meged, J. W., Bodker, M., & Dam Wiedemann, C. (2021). Existential walking. *Annals of Tourism Research*, *87*, Article 103118. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.annals.2020.103118

Philosopher's Path. (n.d.). *Japan-guide.com*. https://www.japan-guide.com/e/e3906.html

Philosopher's Way, San Francisco. (2024, January 6). In *Wikipedia*. https://en.wikipedia.org/w/index.php?title=Philosopher%27s_Way,_San_Francisco&oldid=1193923675

Que, N. S., & Rodriguez, A. M. G. (Eds.). (1997). *Pagdiriwang sa meron: A festival of thought celebrating Roque J. Ferriols, S.J.* Office of Research and Publications, Ateneo de Manila University.

Relph, E. (1976). *Place and placelessness*. Pion.

Robertson, D. J. (2022, August 8). *Philosophy attractions of Athens: Where to go if you're interested in ancient wisdom*. Medium. https://medium.com/stoicism-philosophy-as-a-way-of-life/philosophy-attractions-of-athens-8265b0f1d8d1

Rousseau, J.-J. (1979). *Emile: Or, on education* (A. Bloom, Trans.). Basic Books. (Original work published 1762)

Samuelson, S. (2023). *Rome as guide to the good life: A philosophical grand tour*. University of Chicago Press.

Schumacher, J. N. (1999). *Father Jose Burgos: A documentary history with Spanish documents and their translation*. Ateneo de Manila University Press.

Seamon, D., & Sowers, J. (2008). Commentary on Place and placelessness. In P. Hubbard, R. Kitchin, & G. Vallentine (Eds.), *Key texts in human geography* (pp. 43–51). Sage.

Sobel, D. (2004). *Place-based education: Connecting classrooms and communities*. The Orion Society.

Stickney, J. (2020). Philosophical walks as place-based environmental education. *Journal of Philosophy of Education*, *54*(4), 1071–1086. https://doi.org/10.1111/1467-9752.12469

TripAdvisor. (n.d.). *Confucius temple day tour in Qufu start from Qufu bullet train station or city*. https://www.tripadvisor.com/AttractionProductReview-g303760-d19074953-Confucius_temple_day_tour_in_Qufu_start_from_Qufu_bullet_train_station_or_city-Quf.html

UNESCO. (n.d.-a). *Enhancing UNESCO-designated sites as learning landscapes*. https://www.unesco.org/en/articles/enhancing-unesco-designated-sites-learning-landscapes

UNESCO. (n.d.-b). *Learning landscapes: Equipping interpretive agents in Kotor*. https://www.unesco.org/en/articles/learning-landscapes-equipping-interpretive-agents-kotor

UNESCO National Commission of the Philippines. (n.d.). *World heritage sites in the Philippines*. https://www.unesco.gov.ph/world-heritage-site-philippines/

UNESCO World Heritage Centre. (n.d.-a). *Baroque churches of the Philippines*. World Heritage List No. 677. https://whc.unesco.org/en/list/677/

UNESCO World Heritage Centre. (n.d.-b). *Historic City of Vigan (UNESCO Canopy)*. https://whc.unesco.org/en/canopy/vigan

UNESCO World Heritage Centre. (n.d.-c). *Rice terraces of the Philippine Cordilleras*. World Heritage List No. 502. https://whc.unesco.org/en/list/502/

UNESCO World Heritage Centre. (n.d.-d). *Tentative lists: Philippines*. https://whc.unesco.org/en/tentativelists/6713

UNESCO World Heritage Centre. (n.d.-e). *The criteria for selection*. https://whc.unesco.org/en/criteria/

UNESCO World Heritage Centre. (n.d.-f). *World heritage list*. https://whc.unesco.org/en/list/

Vander Ark, T., Liebtag, E., & McClennen, N. (2020). *The power of place: Authentic learning through place-based education*. ASCD.

Villaroman, N. G. (2018). *Dapitanon*. New Day Publishers.

Voltaire. (2021). *Candide ou l'optimisme*. Encore Éditions. https://ebookcentral.proquest.com/lib/ateneo/detail.action?docID=4683088 (Original work published 1759)